



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/705,466	11/10/2003	John Michael Humphrey	PC23161A	5735
23913	7590	11/17/2004	EXAMINER	
PFIZER INC 150 EAST 42ND STREET 5TH FLOOR - STOP 49 NEW YORK, NY 10017-5612			DAVIS, BRIAN J	
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			1621	

DATE MAILED: 11/17/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary	Application No. 10/705,466	Applicant(s) HUMPHREY ET AL.	
	Examiner Brian J. Davis	Art Unit 1621	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --
Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☐ Responsive to communication(s) filed on ____.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-24 is/are pending in the application.
 4a) Of the above claim(s) ____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☒ Claim(s) 1,3,4,6-14,16-21 and 23 is/are allowed.
- 6) ☐ Claim(s) ____ is/are rejected.
- 7) ☒ Claim(s) 2,5,15,22,24 is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) ____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on ____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
 Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
 Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
 a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. ____.
 3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date. ____. |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152) |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date ____. | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: ____. |

DETAILED ACTION

Claim Objections

Claim 2 is objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c), as being of improper dependent form for failing to further limit the subject matter of a previous claim. Applicant is required to cancel the claim(s), or amend the claim(s) to place the claim(s) in proper dependent form, or rewrite the claim(s) in independent form. The "limitation" that C₁ and C₂ be chiral is intrinsic to the compound defined by the diagram of claim 1. Additionally, claim 2 actually expands the permissible substituents on C₂ beyond the NO₂ of the diagram. Finally, the "limitation" that one atom or group attached to C₁ be different from the atoms or groups attached to C₂ is intrinsic to the compound defined by the diagram of claim 1.

Claims 5 and 24 are objected to because of the following informalities: the claims do not end with a period (after the structures). Claims must begin with a capital letter and end with a period. MPEP 608.01(m). Appropriate correction is required.

Claim 15 is objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c), as being of improper dependent form for failing to further limit the subject matter of a previous claim. Applicant is required to cancel the claim(s), or amend the claim(s) to place the claim(s) in proper dependent form, or rewrite the claim(s) in independent form. R is already defined exclusively as C₁-C₅ alkyl in claim 1.

Claim 22 is objected to because of the following informalities: the claim depends from a following claim. The examiner respectfully suggests that claim 22 should properly depend from claim 21.

Applicant's assistance is respectfully requested in correcting any other minor errors or inconsistencies that may be present in the claims.

Allowable Subject Matter

Claims 1, 3, 4, 6-14, 16-21 and 23 are allowed. The following is a statement of reasons for the indication of allowable subject matter:

The closest prior art appears to be WO 01/77100 A2, cited by applicant in the specification. As applicant points out, the instant compounds are intermediates used in a further synthesis. In the cited prior art, extensively outlined in the instant specification, the instant compounds are used as a racemic mixture. Indeed, no separation of isomers is contemplated, since the subsequent synthesis steps manipulate stereocenters as desired.

At best, it might have been obvious to try to separate the instant isomers based upon differences in solubility, since it is certainly well known in the chemical arts to exploit such differences. However, an 'obvious to try' standard is impermissible in two situations: 1) where the prior art gives no indication as to which of numerous parameters are critical, or gives no indication as to which of many possible choices is likely to be successful; and 2) where the prior art gives only general guidance with respect to the form of the invention but not how to achieve it new areas of technology or


in fields of experimentation which are only seemingly promising. *In re O'Farrell*, 853 F2d 894, 7 USPQ 2d 1673, 1681 (Fed. Cir. 1988). In the instant case, 1) above applies. There is no motivation to choose to exploit solubility difference as opposed to numerous other separation techniques for stereoisomers.

Conclusion

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Brian J. Davis whose telephone number is 571-272-0638. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:30-5:00.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Johann Richter can be reached on 571-272-0646. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).


Brian J. Davis
November 14, 2004

BRIAN DAVIS
PRIMARY EXAMINER